



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

300 Martin Luther King Blvd.

March 9, 2023

TIME: 4:30 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Rush Denson called the meeting to order at 4:31 p.m.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. Approve February 9, 2023 minutes

A motion was made by Linda Lanz to approve the February 9, 2023 minutes. The motion was seconded by Elaine Burton. All approved.

3. CITIZEN COMMUNICATIONS

(Limit comments to five minutes or less)

There were no citizen comments.

4. OLD BUSINESS

There was no business to discuss.

5. NEW BUSINESS

2. 121 S 9th St: Downtown Historic District

COA: Pavers and Lighting

Applicant: 413 Group, LLC

Agenda Item #: 1

Meeting Date: 03/09/23

Action Requested: COA: Brick Paver and Lighting

Location of Property: 121 S. 9th St; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Museum of East Alabama

Resources:

Location is sidewalk along Avenue A facing mural.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Demo existing sidewalk against the south museum wall, pour new concrete curbing where necessary and install pavers over existing parking area extending the Avenue A.
2. Install underground wiring and drainage system.
3. Install lighting to illuminate mural on South side of museum wall.

Proposed Guidelines:

A. THE ENVIRONMENT:

1. The environment consists of all exterior features in the designated historic districts which are visible to the public and includes structures, outbuildings, landscaping, streets, appurtenances, trees, mass and spacing between structures, scale, mass, color and materials of buildings that give a neighborhood its distinguishing character and contributes to its historic district designation.
2. Significant landscape features such as public parks and gardens, street lighting, signs, street benches, sidewalks, streets, alleys and building setbacks that have traditionally been maintained in the historic district and that contribute to its historic character should be retained. Existing streets should not be widened. paving material should not be changed to a different texture and color. Inappropriate new streets or parking lots incompatible with the neighborhood should not be constructed. (*updated 08/12/14*)
3. New plant materials, fencing, walkways, housing and other outdoor lights, signs, benches, etc. should be compatible with the character of the neighborhood in size, scale, material and color.
4. Plant material should be maintained so as not to become a hazard to the public, public property or shall not be allowed to cause deterioration to structures.
5. Existing street trees should not be removed without supporting documentation and a plan for replacement. Trees located in the city right of way cannot be removed without city approval (*updated 09/09/22*)

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Back yard Tree house, swing sets and trampolines
- Benches and other outdoor furniture and accessories
- Sculpture and another outdoor artwork
- Pools and patios
- Tree pruning, clearing of overgrown bushes, vines, saplings, etc.
- Tree removal (less than 4" diameter at breast height or diseased).
- Planting new trees, shrubs, ground cover, etc.
- Landscape edging
- Flower, vegetable and rock gardens
- Flowerpots, planters, window boxes, birdbaths, bird houses, etc.
- Adding gravel to existing driveways
- Patching deteriorated concrete or asphalt pavement, walks, steps, etc.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- New or expanded parking areas/lots
- New and expanded driveways and walkways
- Staff approval for change of materials (i.e. gravel to concrete)
- Staff approval for tree removal with supporting documentation from a Certified Arborist that the tree is either dead, in severe decline, and/or possess a high risk of failure. Trees to be reviewed by the City Arborist. A tree replacement plan must be provided. (*Updated 09/09/22*)

LIGHTING - #21.

Use light fixtures to unify the streetscape and accent the buildings at night.

STYLE: Period Street lighting, such as free—standing lamp posts, is presently available in several styles and forms. Traditional or modern designs are appropriate and ornate designs may be appropriate if they are based on documentation. Fake looking “colonial” lamp posts are not appropriate for most historic commercial areas.

TYPE: Incandescent, gas lighting, and vapor lighting are appropriate. Harsh cold florescent lighting should be avoided.

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of extending sidewalk over existing parking and laying brick pavers.

2. Underground wiring and drainage system does not require approval. Staff recommends approval of inground uplighting.

Discussion:

Staff provided an overview of the project and site plan.

There was no discussion.

John Marsh motioned for approval. Mark Grantham seconded. All approved.

3. 501 N. 8th St: Northside Historic District
COA: Tree Removal
Owner: Jane Killian Fleming

Agenda Item #:	2
Meeting Date:	3/09/23
Action Requested:	Retroactive COA: Removal of Tree
Location of Property:	501 N. 8th St; Northside Historic District
Petitioner:	Jane Killian Fleming

Resources:

Circa 1925; One story, wood frame bungalow with hip roof of asphalt shingles, exposed rafters under eaves, trip dormer with window band, off centered double leaf wood and plate glass doors, flanking vertical eight pane window band with horizontal window band over verticals, short double colonettes on brick bases, closed rail balustrade. Contributing structure.

History: Received call on February 13, 2023 that tree had been removed. Staff contacted applicant about submitting retroactive COA.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Remove dying pecan tree in rear yard. Tree is losing limbs and there is high risk of damage to main structure and neighboring property. An Oak will be planted in rear yard. A Red Maple and Dogwood will be planted in the front yard along with other shrubs/plantings.

Guidelines:

A. THE ENVIRONMENT:

1. The environment consists of all exterior features in the designated historic districts which are visible to the public and includes structures, outbuildings, landscaping, streets, appurtenances, trees, mass and spacing between structures, scale, mass, color and materials of buildings that give

a neighborhood its distinguishing character and contributes to its historic district designation.

2. Significant landscape features such as public parks and gardens, street lighting, signs, street benches, sidewalks, streets, alleys and building setbacks that have traditionally been maintained in the historic district and that contribute to its historic character should be retained. Existing streets should not be widened. paving material should not be changed to a different texture and color. Inappropriate new streets or parking lots incompatible with the neighborhood should not be constructed. (*updated 08/12/14*)
3. New plant materials, fencing, walkways, housing and other outdoor lights, signs, benches, etc. should be compatible with the character of the neighborhood in size, scale, material and color.
4. Plant material should be maintained so as not to become a hazard to the public, public property or shall not be allowed to cause deterioration to structures.
5. Existing street trees should not be removed without a plan for replacement. (*updated 08/12/14*)

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Back yard Tree house, swing sets and trampolines
- Benches and other outdoor furniture and accessories
- Sculpture and another outdoor artwork
- Pools and patios
- Tree pruning, clearing of overgrown bushes, vines, saplings, etc.
- Tree removal (less than 4" diameter at breast height or diseased).
- Planting new trees, shrubs, ground cover, etc.
- Landscape edging
- Flower, vegetable and rock gardens
- Flowerpots, planters, window boxes, birdbaths, bird houses, etc.
- Adding gravel to existing driveways
- Patching deteriorated concrete or asphalt pavement, walks, steps, etc.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- New or expanded parking areas/lots
- New and expanded driveways and walkways
- Staff approval for change of materials (i.e. gravel to concrete)

Staff recommendation:

1. *Staff recommends approval of removing dying tree before damage is done to structure based on its close proximity to home and threat to neighboring property.*
2. *Staff approves of tree replacement plan.*

Discussion:

Staff explained the history for retroactive request and tree replacement plan.

Retroactive fee has been paid.

There was no discussion.

Linda Lanz motioned to approve staff recommendation. John Marsh seconded. All approved.

4. 314 3rd Ave: Northside Historic District
COA: New Construction Pool House
Applicant: J. Manifold Construction
Agenda Item #: 3
Meeting Date: 03/09/2023
Action Requested: COA: New Construction Pool House
Location of Property: **314 3rd Ave; Northside Historic District**
Petitioner: J. Manifold Construction

Resources:

Circa 1910. Two story, brick Neoclassical Revival residence with hip roof of asphalt shingles, three bay façade, second floor façade with central wood door with transom, flanking 4/1 double hung sash windows, first floor façade with central wood and glass door, flanking 4/1 double hung sash windows, two story partial width portico with Corinthian columns, second floor balcony, open rail balustrade, side porch. Contributing structure.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. New construction pool house measuring 29'9" x 26'9" with exterior envelope of brick foundation with Hardie accents, soffit, and fascia to be painted Hardie. Aluminum clad/ wood windows with SDL exterior grids to match existing house. Smooth flush glazed fiberglass doors with low-e glass. Architectural shingle roof and aluminum gutters. Wood pavilion

columns will be repurposed on front. If exterior light fixtures are needed, selection will match style, finish, and color of existing.

Guidelines:

G. NEW CONSTRUCTION:

1. Definition: The construction of any free-standing structure on any lot or addition to an existing structure.
2. General Principles:
 1. These guidelines shall apply only to the exteriors of buildings and to areas of lots visible from public right-of-way.
 2. The public facades, front and street-related elevations, of proposals for new buildings shall be more carefully reviewed than other facades.
 3. New buildings should be compatible with other architectural styles in the historic district but are not required to imitate the past architectural styles of the historic district. They should reflect the era of their own construction.
 4. Since construction in a historic district has usually taken place continuously from the nineteenth century to the present, a variety of building types and styles result which demonstrate the changes in building tastes and technology over the years. The special architectural character of the majority of the buildings in the historic district is responsible for this designation and new buildings should complement and be compatible with the prevailing architectural styles of other buildings in the historic district.
 5. Reconstruction may be appropriate when it reproduces facades of a building which no longer exists and which was located in the historic district if; the building would have contributed to the historical and architectural character of the area, and if it will be compatible in terms of style, height, scale, massing, and materials with the buildings immediately

surrounding the lot on which the reproduction will be built, and if it is accurately based on pictorial documentation.

6. New buildings should related to an established pattern and rhythm of existing contributing buildings, both on the same and opposite sides of a street, the dominance of that pattern and rhythm must be respected and not disrupted.
 7. New construction should be consistent with existing contributing buildings along a street in terms of height, scale, setback, and rhythm; relationship of materials, texture, details and color; roof shape; orientation and proportion and rhythm of openings.
-
1. Height: New buildings should be compatible in height with the height of adjacent buildings. This shall not mean that new construction must be the same height as adjacent structures, but that new construction should be of similar heights as adjacent structures. New construction may not be over one story higher than adjacent structures or more than one story lower than adjacent structures.
-
1. Scale: The size of a new building; its mass in relation to open spaces; its windows, doors, openings and porches should be visually compatible with the surround buildings.
-
1. The relationship and use of materials, texture, details and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible with and similar to those of adjacent buildings or shall not contrast conspicuously.
-
1. The roofs of new buildings shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly with the roof shape and orientation of surrounding buildings.
-
1. The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent buildings must be maintained. When a definite rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width, infill new buildings should maintain the rhythm.

1. Orientation: The site orientation of new buildings shall be consistent with that of adjacent buildings and shall be visually compatible. Directional expression shall be compatible with surrounding buildings, whether that expression is vertical, horizontal or non-directional.

1. The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids to voids in new buildings shall be visually compatible with the surrounding buildings.

3. Outbuildings:

1. Garages and storage buildings should reflect the character of the existing structure and surrounding buildings and should be compatible in terms of height, scale, roof shape, materials, texture and details.

2. Garages, if visible from the street, should be situated on the lot as historically traditional from the neighborhood.

3. The location and design of outbuildings should not be visually disruptive to the character of the surrounding buildings.

4. Appurtenances: Appurtenances related to new buildings, including driveways, sidewalks, lighting, fences, and walls, shall be visually compatible with the environment of the existing buildings and sites to which they relate.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Maintenance repairs to garages and accessory buildings when there is no change in the design and material.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Garages and accessory structures not larger than 8' x 12' in rear yards and not visible from the street (staff approval)

- Garages and accessory structures larger than 8' x 12' or that are visible from the street (commission approval)

Staff recommendation:

1. *New construction should be compatible with other architectural styles in the district but reflect the era of its own construction. This plan meets the new construction guidelines for height, scale, materials, and setback. The orientation has rear of building facing N. 4th Street.*
2. *Staff recommends approval of exterior materials of Hardi and brick, architectural shingle roof, wood columns, fiberglass doors, and wood SDL windows w/PVC brick mold.*
3. *If trees must be removed, applicant to first return to commission with tree replacement plan for approval. Building should be screened from street view.*
4. *Approval is contingent upon Zoning Board approval of setback variance.*

Discussion:

Staff provided an overview of the new construction plan for a pool house. Photos provided show the rear view of the property and pavilion currently in place along with elevation plans and material specs.

John Marsh asked if fiberglass doors have been approved in the past. Staff stated that the doors will be facing inward toward the pool and will not be visible from the street. Fiberglass doors were allowed for the new town home construction project on Geneva Street.

John Marsh motioned to approve. The motion was seconded by Mark Grantham. All approved.

5. 206 S. 8th St: Downtown Historic District

COA: Facade Renovation

Owner: Sirco, Inc.

Agenda Item #: 4

Meeting Date: 03/09/23

Action Requested: COA: Façade Renovation

Location of Property: 206 S. 8th St; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Sirco, Inc.

Resources:

Sirco, Inc: c. 1900; One story brick load bearing wall construction. Original facade has been completely covered with stucco. Glass and metal storefront. Conditionally Contributing structure.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Remove all existing stucco and brick. Install new red brick to bring building inline with other buildings downtown. Brick details to include row lock and soldier course across the top, decorative detail with row lock at the center, and row lock at bottom of windows.
2. Double doors will be shifted together, and new wood and glass doors installed.
3. Windows will be raised approximately one foot at bottom and be a single pane of glass to look like adjoining property.

Proposed Guidelines:

STANDARD #5: Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be retained and preserved.

STANDARD # 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

STOREFRONT - #2.

Preserve existing historic storefronts. Retain characteristic storefront features.

DISPLAY WINDOW: Maintain the original dimensions and transparent nature of the display window. Do not add small paned windows or reflective glass.

COLUMNS: Maintain cast iron columns and brick and stone piers which frame the storefront.

TRANSOM: Retain original shape and transparency of the transom. Do not place a sign over the transom, If an interior ceiling has been lowered below the transom, it should be recessed from the storefront. Do not place air conditioning units in the transom.

AWNINGS - #5.

Awnings should be compatible with the design of the building and the streetscape.

PRESERVATION: Preserve original canopies and awning hardware where feasible.

MATERIALS: Fabric awnings are appropriate. Vinyl coated canvas and acrylic

awnings may be acceptable. Metal awnings may be appropriate in a few instances, but rough sawn wood, plastic, or asphalt shingle awnings give an immobile, hard, mansard—like appearance and are not appropriate.

DESIGN: Retractable or fixed standard shed—type canvas awnings are appropriate. Fake mansard roofs and rustic wood shingle awnings are inappropriate. Carefully coordinate the awning color with other building design features.

LOCATION: The awning should fit the dimensions of the storefront within the masonry opening and should not obscure architectural details. Mount the awning just above or just below the transom. Where feasible, align the awning so that it is the same height as others on the block. Upper story awnings should fit inside the window surround. Arched windows should have awnings shaped like the curvature of the arch, and rectangular windows should have rectangular awnings.

UPPER STORY WINDOWS - #7.

Preserve the size, shape, details, and transparency of upper story windows.

PRESERVATION: The glass, sash, hardware, and window surrounds, including the lintel or decorative window hoods, should be preserved and maintained. Add shutters to the exterior only if they originally existed. Shutters should be operable or should at least appear to be operable; when closed over an opening, they should fit the size of the opening. (see Preservation Brief #9, 10)

RE-ESTABLISHMENT: Consider reopening closed or blocked windows. In some cases, closed exterior shutters may be used to define original window dimensions. Instead of boarding up windows when the second story is not in use, hang curtains or interior shutters to give the building an occupied appearance. Reflective and dark, tinted glass is not appropriate.

REPLACEMENT: Replacement windows are only recommended when historic windows can not be rehabilitated. When replacement windows are installed, they should match the historic window in size, style, and materials and have the same number of panes. Interior storm windows are preferable to exterior ones. Wood windows are recommended, but painted metal windows may be acceptable. (see Preservation Brief #3)

DOORS - #9.

Preserve the original front doors and opening.

PRESERVATION: The original size and shape of door openings should be maintained, not in-filled. Original doors and door hardware should be repaired and maintained. Replacement doors, when necessary, should be compatible with

the original doors in terms of style, size, material, and glass panel configuration.

CANOPIES - #17.

Maintain original canopies and balconies.

PRESERVATION: Although canopies, porches, and balconies are not commonly found on commercial buildings, when they exist, they are distinctive features. Original materials, details, shape, outline, and roof height should be retained. Enclosing canopies and balconies is not appropriate if it destroys the visual openness of the porch appearance. Concrete canopies or covered walkways are not appropriate.

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of removing existing stucco and brick and installing new brick.
2. Staff recommends approval of shifting doors together and installing double wood doors.
3. Staff recommends approval of raising windows and installing single glass.

Discussion:

Staff explained Sirco would like to renovate the front façade of their building. The applicant, Jeffrey Simon, was present and explained the original plan that provided a circular pattern at the top. The stucco that was applied during urban renewal will be removed along with the brick and the front made flush. A red brick will be installed. The double doors will no longer be separated but will be together.

Rush Denson asked that with there being two separate doors, are there two separate offices. Mr. Simon explained that at one time he had an engineering office in the right side. But they will be returning it to one single space. The doors will be inset slightly for rain. All the framing will be wood. The doors will be wood. Depending on what is found when everything is stripped down, the lentil may have to be replaced.

John Marsh stated what really distinguishes new brickwork and can look odd in historic downtowns is using very modern brick and mortar. Mortar color will make a huge impact. Mr. Simon said he is open to suggestions. Mr. Marsh said a darker red brick would look better. The bright red looks like a new neighborhood. The buff colored mortar like what was used on the new wall on S. 8th Street would be most appropriate. The repairs being done at Southern Crossing and The Gallery are with darker brick.

Staff asked the applicant to return door specs for approval prior to installation.

Mr. Simon stated he would be happy to do so.

John Marsh made a recommendation to approve with contingent that the applicant return with doors for Staff approval. Linda Lanz seconded. All approved.

6. 704 1st Ave: Downtown Historic District

COA: Lighting

Owner: Hayley Investments

Agenda Item #: 5

Meeting Date: 03/09/23

Action Requested: COA: Lighting

Location of Property: 704 1st Ave; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Hayley Investments

Resources:

Building: After 1924; one story brick load bearing wall construction; flat arched windows; brick pilasters on upper façade. Contributing structure.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Two light fixture in bronze to be installed across the front (4) and right side (4), a gooseneck light (1) above side door, an exterior flood (1) above rear door, and two (2) small 4.8" x 3.5" pool mount to down light the saloon sign.

Proposed Guidelines:

SIGNS - #6.

LIGHTING: The sign should be illuminated to fit the design of the building. The color and intensity of illumination are central to achieving a complimentary balance of the building and signs. Light intensity should not overpower the building or street edge. Sign lighting should be subdued or indirect. Internally lit (*including digital*) plastic signs are not appropriate, although, in some cases, neon signs may be appropriate. Neon lighting should be used in limited volume to ensure that it does not become visually obtrusive and dominate the street frontage. Incandescent lights are preferable to the harsh, cold appearance of fluorescent lights. Flashing lights are not appropriate. (*updated 08/12/14*)

HISTORIC SIGNS: Retain historic signs whenever possible. (See Preservation Brief #25.) Preserve signs that: reflect the history of a building or district; are characteristic of a particular historic period or style; are associated with events,

people, or places; are evidence of the history of a product or business; display excellent craftsmanship, use of materials, or design; are incorporated into the buildings design or physical fabric. *Photo evidence of previous sign design and/or style is encouraged. (Updated 08/12/14).*

LIGHTING - #21.

Use light fixtures to unify the streetscape and accent the buildings at night.

STYLE: Period Street lighting, such as free—standing lamp posts, is presently available in several styles and forms. Traditional or modern designs are appropriate and ornate designs may be appropriate if they are based on documentation. Fake looking “colonial” lamp posts are not appropriate for most historic commercial areas.

TYPE: Incandescent, gas lighting, and vapor lighting are appropriate. Harsh cold florescent lighting should be avoided.

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of the gooseneck light over the side door and rear flood light. However, Staff does not recommend the two-light wall mounts as they are not within the period and there is no documentation of more modern lighting being used within the district.

Discussion:

Staff provided overview of lighting plan for project. Dorris sign will provide renderings and specs for signage later.

John Marsh said it is difficult to draw a line between historic and modern lighting. The lights approved in the pavers are rather modern. Large floodlights in a prominent spot would look out of place. These cylinder lights shine both up and down.

Staff explained the paver lights at the Museum feature lights shining at the mural. They are not façade fixtures. The explanation given by the applicant was he wanted to use the same lighting used at Sneak and Dawdle. The staff were unaware this lighting was at this location and had to do a site visit. This is not the lighting that was approved. A gooseneck light was approved for installation at this location.

John Marsh asked if modern lighting is defined? Staff answered that it is not clearly defined.

Linda Lanz stated that she thinks these cylinder lights are attractive.

John Marsh motioned to approve. Elaine Burton seconded the motion. All approved.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

7. Enforcement Report
There were no new reports.
8. Staff Report
Staff reported a review of our ordinance and enforcement process for historic preservation is being done. The staff are researching other cities and SHPO documents. Periodic reports will be provided as progress is made.
9. Next meeting DATE
1. Next meeting April 13, 2023

7. ADJOURN

A motion was made by John Marsh to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mark Grantham. All approved.

The meeting adjourned at 5:01 p.m.

Rush Denson, Chair

Linda Lanz, Secretary