



# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

300 Martin Luther King Blvd.

**April 13, 2023**

**TIME: 4:30 PM**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Rush Denson called the meeting to order at 4:37 p.m.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**A motion was made by Debbie Purves to approve the March 9, 2023 minutes. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.**

1. Approve March 9, 2023 minutes

3. CITIZEN COMMUNICATIONS

(Limit comments to five minutes or less)

There were no citizen comments.

4. OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business to discuss.

5. NEW BUSINESS

2. 715 Ave D: Geneva Historic District

COA: Iron Fencing

Owner: Pam Pouncy

**Agenda Item #: 1**

**Meeting Date: 04/13/2023**

**Action Requested: COA: Iron Fence**

**Location of Property: 715 Ave D; Geneva Historic District**

**Petitioner: Pam Pouncy**

**Resources:**

*Circa. 1900. One and one-half story frame, gabled front bay, original wrap-around porch stripped, replacement portico. Contributing Structure*

**Proposal:** The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Install 29ft of fence line facing 8<sup>th</sup> Street of 5ft tall antique iron/metal fence cut into 5ft sections to include two sections of fence and a gate. The fence will be refinished with finials added.

Guidelines:

10. Appurtenances:

- a. Appurtenances related to a building (fences, walls, outdoor lighting, steps, paving, sidewalks and signs) should be visually compatible with the environment to which they are related.

b. Fences:

The size, scale, and transparent quality of the fence shall be considered in the design to minimize the impact on the historic fabric on the neighborhood. The orientation and location of the fence shall also be considered, with the structural members located on the interior of the fence (pretty side out) and the location and size such that it does not block views of the buildings from the street. Front, side and rear yard area will be determined on a case-by-case basis from a site plan showing the footprint of house and proposed fence, due to the variety of lot and building shapes. Generally speaking, the front yard is the portion of lot between the street and the rear edge of the building; the side yard is the portion of lot behind the house, between the sidewalk and the rear corner of the building, on corner lots; and the rear yard is the portion of lot behind house. Staff approval may be granted for fences that clearly fall within the guideline specifications; particularly those pertaining to staff permissible-materials and fence heights.

1. Low retaining walls in front and side yards should be kept where they exist. If new retaining walls are required, they should match the existing or match a documented example correct for the period of the structure.

1. Existing period fencing should be maintained and repaired. Where necessary to replace period fencing, it should be replaced with compatible fencing of the same material, size and appropriate design.

1. Materials:

Where a fence is desired to be installed, it should be appropriate for the period and architectural style of the structure. Materials and size of the fence should be documented as correct for the period of the structure.

- i. Appropriate materials: wood, iron, wire, stone or plants.

ii. Inappropriate materials: chain link, concrete block, unfaced concrete, plastic, fiberglass, plywood, slatted "snow" fences and mesh "construction" fences

1. Chain link fences may be used in rear yards, if visible from the street, shall be camouflaged with vegetation.
2. Staff approved fences are limited to wood dog ear and open gothic fences as pictured below. Other styles or materials require formal Commission approval.

1. Heights:

Generally, low fences should be used at the fronts and visible street side yards near public sidewalks. Taller fences and solid walls may be used in rear yards and side yards when set back from the sidewalk.

i. front yard fences should not be taller than 4 feet. A height of up to 6 feet is permitted only if set back at least 1/3 the structure's length or 1/3 the adjacent structure's length, whichever is furthest from the street. Measurement should be taken from the structures' respective facades.

ii. side yard fences should not be taller than 6 feet

iii. rear yard fences should not be taller than 8 feet

Requests for new fences must have a site plan, with proposed fence heights clearly marked.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Repairs to existing walls and fences and other historic site features
- Wood dog ear and wood open gothic fences that clearly fall within the setback and height requirements (staff approval)

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- All new fences and walls

**Staff recommendation:**

1. Staff recommends approval of installation of iron fence with finials.

**Discussion:**

Staff explained the applicant has removed a wood fence and wishes to replace it with a decorative iron fence.

Rush Denson opened the floor for public comment. There were none.

There was no further discussion.

**A motion was made by Debbie Purvis to approve. The motion was seconded by Mark Grantham. All approved.**

3. 315 N. 4th St: Northside Historic District  
COA: Privacy Fence and Deck  
Owner: Tom & Kathy Nist

**Agenda Item #:** 2  
**Meeting Date:** 04/13/2023  
**Action Requested:** COA: Privacy Fence and Deck  
**Location of Property:** 315 N. 4<sup>th</sup> St; Northside Historic District  
**Petitioner:** Tom & Kathy Nist

**Resources:**

*Circa 1915. One story, wood frame pyramidal roof cottage with roof of asphalt shingles, weatherboard siding, interior brick chimney, central wood door with glass transom, flanking pairs of 1/1 double hung sash windows, recessed porch with columns. Contributing Resource.*

**Proposal:** The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Install 50ft of 6ft high cedar and pine privacy fence along 4<sup>th</sup> Ave.
2. Install 12ft x 20ft deck using Trex composite decking and 42" high railing of Trex composite material.

**Guidelines:**

10. Appurtenances:

- a. Appurtenances related to a building (fences, walls, outdoor lighting, steps, paving, sidewalks and signs) should be visually compatible with the environment to which they are related.

b. Fences:

The size, scale, and transparent quality of the fence shall be considered in the design to minimize the impact on the historic fabric on the neighborhood. The orientation and location of the fence shall also be considered, with the structural members located on the interior of the fence (pretty side out) and the location and size such that it does not block views of the buildings from the street. Front, side and rear yard area will be determined on a case-by-case basis from a site plan showing the footprint of house and proposed fence, due to the variety of lot and building shapes. Generally speaking, the front yard is the portion of lot between

the street and the rear edge of the building; the side yard is the portion of lot behind the house, between the sidewalk and the rear corner of the building, on corner lots; and the rear yard is the portion of lot behind house. Staff approval may be granted for fences that clearly fall within the guideline specifications; particularly those pertaining to staff permissible-materials and fence heights.

1. Low retaining walls in front and side yards should be kept where they exist. If new retaining walls are required, they should match the existing or match a documented example correct for the period of the structure.

1. Existing period fencing should be maintained and repaired. Where necessary to replace period fencing, it should be replaced with compatible fencing of the same material, size and appropriate design.

#### 1. Materials:

Where a fence is desired to be installed, it should be appropriate for the period and architectural style of the structure. Materials and size of the fence should be documented as correct for the period of the structure.

- i. Appropriate materials: wood, iron, wire, stone or plants.
- ii. Inappropriate materials: chain link, concrete block, unfaced concrete, plastic, fiberglass, plywood, slatted "snow" fences and mesh "construction" fences

1. Chain link fences may be used in rear yards, if visible from the street, shall be camouflaged with vegetation.
2. Staff approved fences are limited to wood dog ear and open gothic fences as pictured below. Other styles or materials require formal Commission approval.

#### 1. Heights:

Generally, low fences should be used at the fronts and visible street side yards near public sidewalks. Taller fences and solid walls may be used in rear yards and side yards when set back from the sidewalk.

- i. front yard fences should not be taller than 4 feet. A height of up to 6 feet is permitted only if set back at least 1/3 the structure's length or 1/3 the adjacent structure's length, whichever is furthest from the street. Measurement should be taken from the structures' respective facades.
- ii. side yard fences should not be taller than 6 feet
- iii. rear yard fences should not be taller than 8 feet

Requests for new fences must have a site plan, with proposed fence heights clearly marked.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Repairs to existing walls and fences and other historic site features
- Wood dog ear and wood open gothic fences that clearly fall within the setback and height requirements (staff approval)

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- All new fences and walls

#### THE ENVIRONMENT:

1. The environment consists of all exterior features in the designated historic districts which are visible to the public and includes structures, outbuildings, landscaping, streets, appurtenances, trees, mass and spacing between structures, scale, mass, color and materials of buildings that give a neighborhood its distinguishing character and contributes to its historic district designation.
2. Significant landscape features such as public parks and gardens, street lighting, signs, street benches, sidewalks, streets, alleys and building setbacks that have traditionally been maintained in the historic district and that contribute to its historic character should be retained. Existing streets should not be widened. paving material should not be changed to a different texture and color. Inappropriate new streets or parking lots incompatible with the neighborhood should not be constructed. (*updated 08/12/14*)
3. New plant materials, fencing, walkways, housing and other outdoor lights, signs, benches, etc. should be compatible with the character of the neighborhood in size, scale, material and color.
4. Plant material should be maintained so as not to become a hazard to the public, public property or shall not be allowed to cause deterioration to structures.

5. Existing street trees should not be removed without supporting documentation and a plan for replacement. Trees located in the city right of way cannot be removed without city approval (*updated 09/09/22*)

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Back yard Tree house, swing sets and trampolines
- Benches and other outdoor furniture and accessories
- Sculpture and another outdoor artwork
- Pools and patios
- Tree pruning, clearing of overgrown bushes, vines, saplings, etc.
- Tree removal (less than 4” diameter at breast height or diseased).
- Planting new trees, shrubs, ground cover, etc.
- Landscape edging
- Flower, vegetable and rock gardens
- Flowerpots, planters, window boxes, birdbaths, bird houses, etc.
- Adding gravel to existing driveways
- Patching deteriorated concrete or asphalt pavement, walks, steps, etc.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- New or expanded parking areas/lots
- New and expanded driveways and walkways
- Staff approval for change of materials (i.e. gravel to concrete)
- Staff approval for tree removal with supporting documentation from a Certified Arborist that the tree is either dead, in severe decline, and/or possesses a high risk of failure. Trees to be reviewed by the City Arborist. A tree replacement plan must be provided. (*Updated 09/09/22*)

**Staff recommendation:**

1. Staff recommends approval of a standing cedar and pine privacy fence along side yard facing 4<sup>th</sup> Ave.
2. Staff recommends approval of rear deck of Trex material not visible from the street.

**Discussion:**

Staff gave an overview of the proposed addition of both the freestanding wood fence and the deck. Multiple photos were provided of the site and materials to be used.

Rush Denson opened the floor for public comment. There were none.

There was no further discussion.

**A motion was made by Debbie Purves to approve. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.**

4. 511 Geneva St: Geneva Historic District

COA: Sign

Applicant: Billboard Signs

**Agenda Item #:** 3

**Meeting Date:** 04/13/2023

**Action Requested:** COA: Sign

**Location of Property:** 511 Geneva St; Geneva Historic District

**Petitioner:** Effective Signs, LLC

**Resources:**

*Circa 1935. Williams-Lynch House. One-story brick English cottage, gable roof, front gable, front chimney with nice brickwork. Contributing Structure.*

**Proposal:** The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Install one 12" x 12" aluminum pan panel with applied vinyl edges bent to 1" D with corners welded and ground smooth on front façade at entry.
2. Install 5' x 4'1" (20sf) non-illuminated grey monument sign with aluminum base, Lexan panels with applied white vinyl lettering.

**Proposed Guidelines:**

d. Signs:

1. The appearance, size, position, method of attachment, texture of materials, color, and design of signs shall be in keeping with the collective characteristics of the structures surrounding the property on which the sign will be located. *Murals and advertising relevant to the historic district is permitted. (updated 08/12/14)*

1. Off-site signs shall not be permitted.

1. Signs shall be limited to one sign for each street frontage per premise and if placed in the yard, less than five feet in height.

1. The maximum area of any sign located in a historic residential district shall be four (4) square feet; the maximum area of any sign in a historic commercial district shall be limited to twenty-four (24) square feet, *and in the Gateway Corridor (Geneva St, 10<sup>th</sup> St, Torbert Ave) shall be limited to forty-eight (48) square feet*, unless acceptable documentation proves that original signage from the date of construction of the building or the most significant architectural renovation of the building was larger. *(updated 08/12/14)*
1. No sign that flashes, blinks, revolves or is put in motion by the atmosphere shall be permitted. No visible bulbs, plastics or luminous paints will be permitted as a part of any sign.
1. Buildings and signs may be illuminated by remote light sources, provided that these light sources are shielded to protect adjacent properties.
1. Signs attached to the structures shall not cover any architectural feature.
1. Real estate signs shall be removed not more than ten (10) calendar days after the closing of a sale of a house, building, or lot.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Real estate signs
- Home security signs
- Temporary signs and banners

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- All new building/business identification signage
- Replacement signs that differ in dimension, design, material or location from the existing

**Staff recommendation:**

1. *Staff recommends approval of panel sign at entry.*
2. *Staff does not recommend approval of metal base monument sign for it does not meet standard #1 of guidelines as “texture of materials, color, and design of signs shall be in keeping with the collective characteristics of the structures surrounding the property on which the sign will be located.”*

3. Sign approval contingent on Planning Department and Building Inspection review and approval of sign location and sign regulation requirements.

**Discussion:**

Staff explained there would be two individual signs installed. One will be a small façade sign. The second is a monument sign in the yard. Staff has supplied examples of other Edward Jones signs that match the exterior material of the primary structure.

Rushed opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Debbie Purves stated the sign should be in more continuous style of the house. It can be simple and clean.

Aaron Kovak stated the sign would be more appropriate if it had a brick veneer wrap to mirror the building, maybe with a brick band around the sign, to match the house. It doesn't have to be overly sophisticated.

Debbie Purves even suggested a single post with a hanging sign.

The applicant stated he would present the options discussed to the business owner for the monument sign. He said they generally work with corporate offices, and this is the standard look. He will do what he can to persuade them in that direction.

Rush Denson suggested he take the recommendations back to corporate. Examples provided in the staff report of other Edward Jones signs that mirror the main structure in design, material, and style were given to the applicant to share with corporate.

**Debbie Purves motioned to approve the wall sign. Mark Grantham seconded the motion. All approved.**

**Debbie Purves motioned that the monument sign be tabled until the next meeting to allow applicant time to provide a new design. Elaine Burton seconded the motion. All approved.**

6. OTHER BUSINESS

5. Enforcement Report

Staff reported that enforcement letters had recently been sent out. She has received a couple of responses.

Debbie Purves asked if First Baptist Church notified anyone prior to the demo of the house on Ave B. Staff stated that she was unaware of the demo and if it had

been permitted. Linda Lanz asked if churches are now required to come to HPC for new construction. Staff responded yes.

6. Staff Report

Staff provided commission members with an updated contact list. Rush Denson welcomed new member, Aaron Kovak, to the board.

7. Next meeting DATE

1. Next meeting May 11, 2023

7. ADJOURN

**A motion was made by Linda Lanz to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Debbie Purves. All approved.**

The meeting adjourned at 5:01 p.m.

---

Rush Denson, Chair

---

Linda Lanz, Secretary