



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

300 Martin Luther King Blvd.

June 9, 2022

TIME: 4:30 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Margaret Mayfeld called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Rush Denson to approve the May 12, 2022 minutes. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.

1. Approve May 12, 2022 minutes

3. CITIZEN COMMUNICATIONS

(Limit comments to five minutes or less)

There were no citizen comments.

4. OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business to discuss.

5. NEW BUSINESS

2. 116 S. 8th St: Downtown Historic District

COA: Replace windows and add trim; Install Juliet balcony; Install new doors; Remove wood

Owners: Hiro & Lyndsay Fukai

Agenda Item #: 1

Meeting Date: 06/09/22

Action Requested: COA: Replace windows, door, add balcony

Location of Property: 116 S. 8th St; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Hiro & Lyndsay Fakai

Resources:

Goodwill Building: Late 19th c.; Two story brick with original façade at upper level; round arched windows. Recent wood infill and denticulation at second level; wood siding, glass and aluminum storefront at ground level.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Remove all existing plywood siding to expose existing brick, touch up, and paint.
2. Remove existing glass, replace upper windows, existing storefront entry at MischMasch to unity the storefront finish.
3. Remove existing 3'0" x 8'0" residential entry on first floor to upper level and re-frame to receive new exterior entry door. Remove existing brick below middle window on second floor and re-frame for exterior door.
4. New fiber cement sheathing to wrap framing to box-in windows at storefront as well as newly exposed transom windows.
5. Shadow box and architectural detail around main entry to upper floor. Add two light fixtures.
6. Fiber cement or similar finish trim detail around upper-level windows.
7. Add Juliet balcony at middle door to open as an interior balcony.
8. Paint existing dental to accentuate the architectural details.
9. Install flat metal canopy awning with pan.
10. Option 2: Add metal balcony with standing seam Mansard roof.

Proposed Guidelines:

STANDARD #5: Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be retained and preserved.

STANDARD # 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

STOREFRONT - #2.

Preserve existing historic storefronts. Retain characteristic storefront features.

DISPLAY WINDOW: Maintain the original dimensions and transparent nature of the display window. Do not add small paned windows or reflective glass.

COLUMNS: Maintain cast iron columns and brick and stone piers which frame the storefront.

TRANSOM: Retain original shape and transparency of the transom. Do not place a sign over the transom. If an interior ceiling has been lowered below the transom, it should be recessed from the storefront. Do not place air conditioning units in the transom.

AWNINGS - #5.

Awnings should be compatible with the design of the building and the streetscape.

PRESERVATION: Preserve original canopies and awning hardware where feasible.

MATERIALS: Fabric awnings are appropriate. Vinyl coated canvas and acrylic awnings may be acceptable. Metal awnings may be appropriate in a few instances, but rough sawn wood, plastic, or asphalt shingle awnings give an immobile, hard, mansard—like appearance and are not appropriate.

DESIGN: Retractable or fixed standard shed—type canvas awnings are appropriate. Fake mansard roofs and rustic wood shingle awnings are inappropriate. Carefully coordinate the awning color with other building design features.

LOCATION: The awning should fit the dimensions of the storefront within the masonry opening and should not obscure architectural details. Mount the awning just above or just below the transom. Where feasible, align the awning so that it is the same height as others on the block. Upper story awnings should fit inside the window surround. Arched windows should have awnings shaped like the curvature of the arch, and rectangular windows should have rectangular awnings

UPPER STORY WINDOWS #7.

Preserve the size, shape, details, and transparency of upper story windows.

PRESERVATION: The glass, sash, hardware, and window surrounds, including the lintel or decorative window hoods, should be preserved and maintained. Add shutters to the exterior only if they originally existed. Shutters should be operable or should at least appear to be operable; when closed over an opening, they should fit the size of the opening. (see Preservation Brief #9, 10)

RE-ESTABLISHMENT: Consider reopening closed or blocked windows. In some cases, closed exterior shutters may be used to define original window dimensions. Instead of boarding up windows when the second story is not in use, hang curtains or interior shutters to give the building an occupied appearance. Reflective and dark, tinted glass is not appropriate.

REPLACEMENT: Replacement windows are only recommended when historic windows can not be rehabilitated. When replacement windows are installed, they should match the historic window in size, style, and materials and have the same number of panes. Interior storm windows are preferable to exterior ones. Wood windows are recommended, but painted metal windows may be acceptable. (see Preservation Brief #3)

DOORS - #9.

Preserve the original front doors and opening.

PRESERVATION: The original size and shape of door openings should be maintained, not in-filled. Original doors and door hardware should be repaired and maintained. Replacement doors, when necessary, should be compatible with the original doors in terms of style, size, material, and glass panel configuration.

CANOPIES - #17.

Maintain original canopies and balconies.

PRESERVATION: Although canopies, porches, and balconies are not commonly found on commercial buildings, when they exist, they are distinctive features. Original materials, details, shape, outline, and roof height should be retained. Enclosing canopies and balconies is not appropriate if it destroys the visual openness of the porch appearance. Concrete canopies or covered walkways are not appropriate.

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of removing existing plywood siding, touching up brick (may require repointing), and painting.
2. Staff recommends approval of replacing existing glass with clear transparent glass, tinted glass is not recommended. Staff recommends approval of replacing upper windows with wood, composite, or aluminum clad windows with same grid pattern of 2/2. Staff recommends approval of replacing two front entry doors with wood and glass doors of like kind or refinishing current doors.
3. Staff recommends approval of installing new wood residential doors on first and second floor. All doors to be submitted to Staff for approval prior to installation.
4. Staff recommends approval of fiber cement sheathing at windows. However, Staff recommends consideration of other alternative materials only under the following circumstances: a) the unavailability of historic materials b) the unavailability of skilled craftsmen c) inherent flaws in the original material, and 4) code-required changes. See Preservation Brief #16 provided.
5. Staff recommends approval of wood shadow box detailing around main entry and upper floor. New light fixtures to be submitted to Staff for approval prior to installation.
6. Staff recommends approval of fiber cement trim detail around upper-level windows.
7. Staff recommends approval of Juliet balcony contingent on city council approval and signed right of way agreement.
8. Painting of existing painted exterior does not require approval.
9. Staff recommends approval of flat metal canopy awning.

Discussion:

Staff explained that the applicant wishes to do a front façade renovation and provided a detailed description of the proposed work. The proposed Juliet balcony is like what is at The Gallery on S. Railroad Ave. Staff recommendations were reviewed. Staff then stated that the State Historic Preservation office had been contacted about the use of alternative materials. SHPO provided several articles on the use of alternative materials in historic preservation and one, Preservation Brief #16, has been included in today's packet. The SHPO did not recommend approval of alternative materials. Staff then contacted several other CLG including, Decatur,

Foley, Eufaula, Mobile, Montgomery, Tuscaloosa, and Savannah, GA. All of these follow the National Standards and do not allow alternative materials on storefronts.

The designer for the applicant, Joel Calleiro, spoke and stated that he has seen materials other than wood used in historic districts. He understands the focus is on the details.

Margaret Mayfield stated that the issue is what we have allowed in the past. Staff we have had request for alternative materials in the past and only allowed wood to be used. The exceptions have been the jewelry store where we allowed the metal framed windows but required the metal to be overlayed in wood. And in the Northside residential area we allowed Trex to be used on decking once.

Mr. Calleiro stated that he modeled this design after the Stone Martin building. Staff explained that this was allowed because N. Railroad and this building is in what is considered the industrial Cotton District. So, the metal framing and industrial look was approved. Whereas this building is in S. Railroad retail district.

Staff reviewed the four circumstances that substitute materials are warranted according to Preservation Brief #16: 1) the unavailability of historic materials; 2) the unavailability of skilled craftsman; 3) inherent flaws in the original materials; and 4) code-required changes.

Linda Lanz stated that inherent flaw in original material could mean? Maybe using wood products is an inherent flaw.

Rush Denson said that area we are asking about is the trim around the door, around the windows (top and bottom).

Linda Lanz asked that there is a property in Northside that we have allowed to pull off the vinyl siding and replace with Hardi. What is the difference in allowing that and allowing it on a storefront?

Mark stated the woods of today, the paints of today, just are not going to last.

Mr. Calleiro stated that there are companies that are producing products specifically for historic buildings to duplicate historic trims and materials.

A motion was made by Mark Grantham to approve the use of cement fiber board materials, based on the three points listed in Preservation Brief #16, and tinted windows to match neighboring property. The motion was seconded by Rush Denson. All approved.

3. 404 S. 8th St: Geneva Historic District
COA: Replace front steps with brick
Owner: CJCF, LLC

Agenda Item #: 2
Meeting Date: 06/09/2022
Action Requested: COA: Replace front wood steps with brick
Location of Property: 404 S. 8th St; Geneva Historic District
Petitioner: CJCF, LLC

Resources:

Sykes-Adams House, prior 1885. One-story frame with hip and cross gable roof. It has double gables on the front. All gables have gingerbread trim. Front windows have shaped decorative trim. This house has been renovated for use as office space but has retained its character. Contributing structure.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Retroactive COA to replace damaged front wood steps with brick.

Proposed Guidelines:

7. Entrances, Porches and Steps:

- a. Porches and steps that are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches or additions that reflect later architectural styles are often important to the building's historical integrity and wherever possible, should be retained.
- b. Original material and architectural features, such as handrails, balusters, columns, brackets and roof decoration shall be preserved. Where necessary to replace deteriorated pieces, the new material should match the original in texture, shape, size and color.
- c. Original details and shape, outline, roof height and roof pitch should be retained.
- d. Enclosing of front porches is inappropriate if done in a manner that destroys their intended appearance.
- e. The enclosing of side and rear porches may be considered appropriate if the visual openness and character of the original porch is maintained.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Minor repairs to materials and features when repaired to match the original
- Porch flooring and ceilings, trim boards, railings, brackets, etc.
- The following commonly requested projects require a COA:
 - Removal or addition of porches

- Screening of side porches according to guidelines (staff approval)
- Screening of front porches according to guidelines (commission approval)
- Enclosure of porches

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends retroactive approval of brick steps at front entry to porch.

Discussion:

Staff explained that this is a retroactive COA. The applicant replaced the rotted front steps and decided to do the replacement with brick to match the side columns and foundation.

There was no additional discussion.

A motion was made by Rush Denson to approve. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.

4. 107 N. 9th St: Downtown Historic District

COA: Brick front columns

Owner: Simon Bak

Agenda Item #: 4

Meeting Date: 06/09/22

Action Requested: COA: Brick front columns

Location of Property: 107 N. 9th St; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Simon Bak

Resources:

Circa 1960; this building is located in the Downtown Historic District. However, it is not listed in the National Registry survey.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Retroactive request to replace rotted front columns with brick.

Guidelines:

STOREFRONT - #2.

Preserve existing historic storefronts. Retain characteristic storefront features.

DISPLAY WINDOW: Maintain the original dimensions and transparent nature of the display window. Do not add small paned windows or reflective glass.

COLUMNS: Maintain cast iron columns and brick and stone piers which frame the storefront.

TRANSOM: Retain original shape and transparency of the transom. Do not place a sign over the transom, If an interior ceiling has been lowered below the transom, it should be recessed from the storefront. Do not place air conditioning units in the transom.

Staff recommendation:

1. *Staff recommends retroactive approval of brick columns on this non-contributing structure.*

Discussion:

Staff explained that this is a retroactive COA request. The applicant replaced the rotted wood and stucco front faux columns with brick columns for durability. There was no further discussion.

A motion was made by Rush Denson to approve. The motion was seconded by Mark Grantham. All approved.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

5. Enforcement Report
There were no new enforcement cases to review.
6. Staff Report
There were no new staff reports to discuss.
7. Next meeting DATE
The next meeting is July 14, 2022
1. Next meeting July 14, 2022

7. ADJOURN

A motion was made by Mark Grantham to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.
The meeting adjourned at 5:05 p.m.