



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

300 Martin Luther King Blvd.

July 21, 2022

TIME: 4:30 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Staff member, Lisa Thrift, called the meeting to order at 4:35 p.m.

1.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Debbie Purves to approve the June 9, 2022 minutes. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.

2. Approve June 9, 2022 minutes

3. CITIZEN COMMUNICATIONS

(Limit comments to five minutes or less)

There were no citizen comments

4. OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business to discuss.

5. NEW BUSINESS

3. 314 N. 9th St: Northside Historic District

COA: Replace glass in windows, Replace rear door with window: Enclose side porch

Owner: Ian Baas

Agenda Item #: 1

Meeting Date: 07/21/2022

Action Requested: COA: Replace glass in windows; Replace rear door with

Window; Enclose side porch

Location of Property: 314 N. 9th St; Northside Historic District

Petitioner: Ian Bass

Resources:

Circa 1920; Once and a half story, wood frame pyramidal roof cottage with roof of asphalt shingles, decorative gables with arched lights, weatherboard siding, central wood door, flanking double hung sash windows, full width porch with hip roof, slender colonettes on brick bases, open rail balustrade. Contributing Resource.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Add double pane glass to all exterior windows, except curved bay windows on the west-facing wall. Original wooden frames will be retained throughout.
1. Remove an old non-functioning door (red) on the back porch (South wall) and adding triple windows in that location. Windows will be framed in wood to match the existing window frames and muntin's found only on the back half of the house. Siding in that location will be redone with clapboard wood siding with a 4.5" reveal to match the existing exterior of the house.
2. Building out over existing side porch to increase interior space. A wrap-around transom window is to be added to the North & East facing walls. Windows will be framed in wood to match existing exterior windows. This will replicate the wrap-around transom windows of 414 N. 10th St. Siding will be clapboard wood with 4.5" reveal to match the existing exterior of the house.

Proposed Guidelines:

5. Windows:

- a. Retain and repair existing windows including window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, pediments, hoods and hardware. If new sashes are used, duplicate the original material, design, size and hardware of the original window. Do not change window size, sash size or windowpane size.
- b. Do not introduce or create new window openings into the front principal elevation of the structure and do not enlarge or reduce original window openings to fit new stock window sizes.
- c. The original number and arrangement of panes should be maintained.
- d. Storm windows should be visually unobtrusive and should not damage existing window frames. Storm windows should be designed so that they can be removed in the future without damage to the original fabric of the structure. Storm windows should be compatible in color and design with the original windows. For example, mill finished aluminum storm windows should not be used with painted window sash.

- e. Plastic, canvas or metal strip awnings or fake shutters that are not compatible with the architectural style of the structure should not be used.
- f. Where existing shutters are replaced or reinstalled when missing, the new shutters shall be sized to fit the window opening, in height and width, whether the shutters are fixed or operable. Composite materials are allowable for shutters so long as they duplicate the original in shape and texture.
- g. New window openings should not be introduced unless they match the existing window configuration and their placement harmonized with the existing rhythm of openings.
- h. Original windows should not be filled in.

6. Doors:

- a. The original size and shape of door openings should be maintained. Original doors and door hardware should be repaired and reused in place. Original transoms, sidelights and doors should be maintained.
- b. Replacement doors when necessary, should be compatible with the original doors in terms of style, texture and size.
- c. Shiny aluminum storm doors and screen doors are not appropriate. Full view storm doors painted to match the door are appropriate.
- d. New door openings should not be introduced on the front, principal façade of the structure.
- e. Original door openings should not be filled in.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Re-glazing of windows or replacing broken panes of glass
- Repairs to original wood windows and doors when there is no change in appearance and material
- Painting of window frames and sashes
- Installation of full view (glazed) storm windows and doors – either wood or aluminum with baked enamel or painted finish are acceptable

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Replacement of original windows
- Removal or addition of a window or door opening
- Exposing a previously covered window units with a replacement according to the guidelines

7. Entrances, Porches and Steps:

- a. Porches and steps that are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches or additions that reflect later architectural styles are often important to the building's historical integrity and wherever possible, should be retained.
- b. Original material and architectural features, such as handrails, balusters, columns, brackets and roof decoration shall be preserved. Where necessary to replace deteriorated pieces, the new material should match the original in texture, shape, size and color.
- c. Original details and shape, outline, roof height and roof pitch should be retained.
- d. Enclosing of front porches is inappropriate if done in a manner that destroys their intended appearance.
- e. The enclosing of side and rear porches may be considered appropriate if the visual openness and character of the original porch is maintained.

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Minor repairs to materials and features when repaired to match the original
- Porch flooring and ceilings, trim boards, railings, brackets, etc.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Removal or addition of porches
- Screening of side porches according to guidelines (staff approval)
- Screening of front porches according to guidelines (commission approval)
- Enclosure of porches

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of replacement of glass with double pane glass, retaining original wood frames, and same muntin configurations with true divided lite.
2. Staff recommends approval of removal of non-functioning door and replacement of window. However, guidelines restrict increasing the size of the opening. This should remain a single window with transom instead of expanding to a triple window. Wood clapboard siding with 4.5" reveal is acceptable.

3. Staff recommends approval of enclosing side porch and wrap-around transom windows to allow for new bath space. Wood clapboard siding with 4.5" reveal is acceptable.

Discussion:

Staff introduced items for discussion with description of the project, photos of the site, renderings, and staff recommendations.

Mark Grantham stated that the back of the house is not original. The guidelines state that changes are not to be made to the first floor street side. These changes will be made to the back side. It says the rhythm of windows should be proper. If you go up 9th Street, the house directly behind them has single, double, and triple windows. So the rhythm of windows on houses throughout the neighborhood. I make the motion that would allow them to do what they're asking based on those three things. The back of the house was an apartment at one time. The previous owner enclosed the breakfast room, which is what you see as the kitchen area now and actually used to be the back porch of the house. He and Emily added the porch across the back. Again, they are not altering anything that is original to the house.

Debbie Purves stated that she does think whether it's original to the house matters so much. It's connected to the house and it is in the historic district. The guidelines should be followed. Mark Grantham answered that the rules say original, change the original doors and windows. These doors and windows are not original in the back of the house. The guidelines also talk about not doing anything to the front side on the first floor. This is on the backside. Debbie Purves asked to see examples of the windows the applicant would be installing. The rendering looks very mid-century or could be Craftsman style. Staff stated that specs for the windows had not been provided. Mark Grantham asked if the staff could approve the windows so that construction is not delayed. Mrs. Thrift stated that if the Commission will set the parameters, she would be able to review the specs and provide Staff approval. They are keeping the original wood frames. The new window will need to have the same kind of moulding or framing, consistent with the rest of the house.

A motion was made by Mark Grantham to approve. All windows should have wood framing and window trim should be consistent in style and framing to match all existing windows. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.

4. 104 N. 9th St: Downtown Historic District
COA: Remove multiple trees
Owner: Ken Pylant

Agenda Item #:	2
Meeting Date:	07/21/2022
Action Requested:	COA: Remove three (6) trees
Location of Property:	104 N. 9th St; Downtown Historic District
Petitioner:	Ken Pylant III/Pyson, LLC

Resources:

This property is located in the Downtown Historic District but is not on the National Register of Historic Places.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Removal of front left water oak with extensive decay, removal of front right double stemmed water oak with internal decay, and removal of three (3) large oaks in rear yard with trunk decay. All are endangering property (house).
1. Removal of pecan tree in order to expand drive for commercial usage.

Proposed Guidelines:**A. THE ENVIRONMENT:**

1. The environment consists of all exterior features in the designated historic districts which are visible to the public and includes structures, outbuildings, landscaping, streets, appurtenances, trees, mass and spacing between structures, scale, mass, color and materials of buildings that give a neighborhood its distinguishing character and contributes to its historic district designation.
2. Significant landscape features such as public parks and gardens, street lighting, signs, street benches, sidewalks, streets, alleys and building setbacks that have traditionally been maintained in the historic district and that contribute to its historic character should be retained. Existing streets should not be widened. paving material should not be changed to a different texture and color. Inappropriate new streets or parking lots incompatible with the neighborhood should not be constructed. (*updated 08/12/14*)
3. New plant materials, fencing, walkways, housing and other outdoor lights, signs, benches, etc. should be compatible with the character of the neighborhood in size, scale, material and color.
4. Plant material should be maintained so as not to become a hazard to the public, public property or shall not be allowed to cause deterioration to structures.
5. Existing street trees should not be removed without a plan for replacement. (*updated 08/12/14*)

The following items DO NOT require a COA:

- Back yard Tree house, swing sets and trampolines
- Benches and other outdoor furniture and accessories
- Sculpture and another outdoor artwork
- Pools and patios
- Tree pruning, clearing of overgrown bushes, vines, saplings, etc.
- Tree removal (less than 4" diameter at breast height or diseased).
- Planting new trees, shrubs, ground cover, etc.
- Landscape edging
- Flower, vegetable and rock gardens
- Flowerpots, planters, window boxes, birdbaths, bird houses, etc.
- Adding gravel to existing driveways
- Patching deteriorated concrete or asphalt pavement, walks, steps, etc.

The following commonly requested projects require a COA:

- Changes to stone walls and other historic site features
- New or expanded parking areas/lots
- New and expanded driveways and walkways
- Staff approval for change of materials (i.e. gravel to concrete)

Staff recommendation:

1. Staff recommends approval of removal of trees based on report provided by forester that trees are damaged and/or decayed and are a hazard to the property.
2. Applicant will be required to provide a tree replacement plan and landscape plan when parking site plan is provided.

Discussion:

Staff presented an explanation of the trees to be removed, photos, and a report from the arborist. Most of these trees are damaged and decaying, with the exception of one pecan tree. However, it is located at the right corner of the house and is obstructing the drive and ability to get to the rear of the house for parking.

Linda Lanz asked what trees would be left on the property. Staff explained that the applicant will be required to provide the Planning Department a landscape and tree replacement plan when he returns with a parking plan for his commercial business.

Matt Mosley, Planning Director, stated that this is a very short lot. The remainder of the lot is owned by the accounting firm to the south. So, it would be most of the trees on the property.

Linda Lanz asked if all commercial properties have to have trees or just landscaping. Mr. Mosley stated that every property has to have landscaping, whether it's trees or not. It's difficult to meet the requirements without putting trees on the property. The parking plan requires HPC approval as well. Staff confirmed that she has already talked to the applicant about gravel parking in the rear. He may also need some off-site parking. Rush Denson asked if we could require certain trees to be planted. Staff explained that we do have a suggested tree planting list from the arborist.

A motion was made by Rush Denson to approve with Staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by Linda Lanz. All approved.

5. 127 S. 8th St: Downtown Historic District

COA: Sign

Owner: Dorris Sign

Agenda Item #: 3

Meeting Date: 07/21/2022

Action Requested: COA: Sign

Location of Property: 127 S. 8th St; Downtown Historic District

Petitioner: Dorris Sign

Resources:

Jackie's Unique Gifts/Old Farmers National Bank: 1909; three-story brick load bearing wall construction; chamfered southeast corner; first story has new glass and metal frames in polished stone panels. Original façade at second and third floor has round arched windows with wood infill; corbelled brick belt coursing articulates top of second and third floor and parapet.

Proposal: The petitioner requests a COA for the following:

1. Install vertical metal double sided sign with push-thru plastic letters attached to wall with lags and anchors. Sign in 30" w x 20' h (51sf) including 42' circle.

Proposed Guidelines:

SIGNS #6.

Signs should complement, rather than compete with, the character of the building and downtown.

These design guidelines apply to the exterior signs within the Northside and Geneva Street Historic Preservation Districts. All signs in a historic preservation district must meet the provisions of the Opelika Zoning Ordinance as well as receive a Certificate of Appropriateness. A Certificate of Appropriateness review will determine whether

a sign proposal meets the context of these guidelines. Whenever there is a conflict between the regulations of the zoning ordinance and these guidelines, the more stringent regulations will take precedence. (*Updated 08/12/13*)

LOCATION: Signs should be designed with the historic character of the building and district in mind. The design should be compatible with the architectural features of a building or neighboring buildings and should not obscure architectural details of the building. Locate signs on flat unadorned parts of the facade or paint directly onto the glass storefront. Hanging signs should not project more than 40 inches beyond adjoining buildings or obscure the view of the streetscape. A hanging sign should be at least 8 feet off the ground. Signs should not be located on the roof. They should be aligned with others in the area in order to create a more uniform appearance. (*Updated 08/12/14*)

TYPES: A variety of signs may adorn a building. Awning signs and small facade sign panels can attract the attention of passing motorists or pedestrians across the street. Signs painted on storefront windows and doors attract the attention of pedestrians. Hanging signs should be attached so that they do not damage the wall surface. Attach signs through joints in the masonry rather than to the brick itself. Moveable or portable signs are not appropriate. Sandwich Boards measuring up to 24" wide by 36" tall may be approved by staff and must be of an A-frame design. The use of painted wood signs is encouraged and the use of metal and plastic signs are discouraged. One sandwich sign per building is permitted, though buildings housing multiple businesses may share a slightly larger, 24" wide by 48" sign. (*Updated 08/12/14*)

SIZE: Size should be determined by the scale of the building, not whether the sign is meant to be viewed by a passing motorist or pedestrian. Generally, lettering should not exceed 18 inches high. The maximum area of any sign in a historic commercial district shall be limited to twenty-four (24) square feet, and in the Gateway Corridor (Geneva St, 10th St, Torbert Ave, 2nd Ave) shall be limited to forty-eight (48) square feet, unless acceptable documentation proves that original signage from the date of construction of the building or the most significant architectural renovation of the building was larger.

Staff recommendation:

1. *Staff recommends approval of vertical sign.*

Discussion:

Staff gave a description of the sign, provided renderings, and gave staff recommendations.

Rush Denson asked if there would be any lights. Staff stated no lights would be used.

There was no further discussion.

A motion was made by Debbie Purves to approve. The motion was seconded

by Rush Denson. All approved.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

- 6. Enforcement Report
There were no new enforcement cases to review.
- 7. Staff Report
There were no new staff reports to discuss.
- 8. Next meeting DATE
- 1. Next meeting is August 11, 2022

7. ADJOURN

A motion was made by Debbie Purves to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mark Grantham. All approved.

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

Margaret Mayfield, Chair
Lanz, Secretary

Linda